

THE MUNICIPALITY OF LAMBTON SHORES

Report DCS 30-2020

Council Meeting Date: December 1, 2020

TO: Mayor Weber and Members of Council
FROM: Steve McAuley, Director of Community Services
RE: Port Franks Marina Remediation

RECOMMENDATION:

THAT Report DCS 30-2020 regarding the Port Franks Marina Remediation be received; and

THAT Council authorize staff to negotiate a final contract with Breakwall Specialists for the installation of a seawall extension at the Port Franks Marina; and

THAT staff be directed to present the final contract and proposed sources of funding at a future meeting

SUMMARY

In the spring of this year Council made the decision not to install docks at the Port Franks Marina due to high water levels. Council also asked staff to consider options to enable marina operations in future years. This report presents an option that would allow the existing seawall to be raised in order to facilitate the installation of docks for the 2021 season.

BACKGROUND

At the May 12, 2020 regular Council meeting, Council passed the following resolutions:

THAT Report DCS 13-2020 regarding the Port Franks Marina be received; and

THAT finger docks not be installed at the Port Franks Marina for the 2020 boating season; and

THAT staff be directed to make alternate arrangements for current Port Franks Marina boaters where ever possible, including the use of transient slips in the Grand Bend Marina, and other options where feasible to accommodate residents of Armstrong East and West; and

THAT staff present a report with options for future marina operations.

For the 2020 boating season, staff was able to accommodate any boater that wanted to temporarily move to Grand Bend as well as the Armstrong East and West boaters who were permitted to moor directly against the seawall.

Lake Huron water levels continue to remain high with a slight decrease in the water level since the high water mark that was observed in late June. Water level reports indicate that the November 27th lake level is 2 inches below that of the same date in 2019. Based on the data available it does not appear that Lake Huron will be dropping any significant amounts soon, as such, it is likely that without some type of remediation to raise the level of the docks, the marina would not be safe for seasonal boaters in 2021.

Currently the docks fasten to the face of the seawall. The current location of this fastening point results in the docks being at, or submerged during times of weather induced surging or seasonally high water levels. In order to raise the docks out of the water staff, in coordination with the Port Franks Yacht Club representatives, have explored various options to raise the seawall and in turn, the fastening points for the docks.

Raising the seawall will generally include welding a 300mm (12”) extension to the top of the existing seawall, moving the dock brackets up, extending the pilings that the end of the docks sits on, and installing a small set of steps at each dock.

Staff and the Port Franks Yacht club representatives have looked at three different options from different contractors to extend the seawall. Because this is a very specialized project, the contractors were asked to give simple budget proposals based on their own design and construction methods and experience. The quotes all involved welding some type of steel structure to the top of the wall. The budget prices we reviewed ranged from \$100,000 to in excess of \$500,000 with the middle price at \$215,000. None of the quotations included extensions to the dock pilings, and the high and low price did not include steps at each dock. The low price also required the Municipality to supply labour and equipment to help with the install. Figure 1 below shows the extent of seawall being proposed to be extended.



Figure 1

After evaluating the quotations with the Port Franks Yacht Club representatives, it appears the quote submitted by Breakwall Specialists at \$215,000 would provide the best solution for the Municipality. Breakwall Specialists are experts in the field of seawall modifications and have a great deal of experience completing this type of remedial work. Their quote includes installation of a very robust section of wall (300mm high) that is comprised of a bent plate that is boxed in on all sides to add strength and rigidity. In addition, they included removable sections of wall at each dock that will be able to be removed when the water level drops.

Breakwall Specialists proposal is considered a budget estimate, and if Council is agreeable with proceeding with the project, staff would fine tune the final terms of the contract to ensure the correct number of docks openings, the municipal responsibilities are agreed to and are documented, and a schedule is agreed to. Once this is complete a final contract along with suggestions for funding sources would be presented to Council for approval.

It is important to note that while a 300mm (12") extension to the seawall will raise the wall enough to allow the docks to be safely installed above the current water level, storm surges produced by Northwest winds will still overtop the wall and result in localized flooding. While this is inconvenient, it is manageable and essentially impossible to prevent due to the height and structure of the wall that would be required to fully mitigate the impacts of these storms.

ALTERNATIVES TO CONSIDER

Staff is presenting an option to remediate the marina to allow operations to continue under the control of the Municipality. Council could also consider operating the marina in the same manner as this past year, with no docks and the launch open to the public.

Council could also completely close the facility to minimize expenses and forgo any revenue.

Council and staff have also heard from local marina operators who are interested in leasing the marina from the municipality. While staff have considered this option, we have not pursued the idea of a lease at this point. If Council is interested in pursuing this option, a Request for Proposal would have to be issued publically to solicit proposals for evaluation. As with any lease the terms and conditions would need to be fully understood by each party.

RECOMMENDED ACTIONS

THAT Report DCS 30-2020 regarding the Port Franks Marina Remediation be received; and

THAT Council authorize staff to negotiate a final contract with Break Specialists for the installation of a seawall extension at the Port Franks Marina; and

THAT staff be directed to present the final contract and proposed sources of funding at a future meeting

FINANCIAL IMPACT

With any of the high water operating scenarios for the Port Franks Marina there will be financial impacts based on either the loss of revenue or the expenditure of capital funds to raise the wall.

It is important to understand that revenue generated by the users of the Port Franks Marina fund not only the operation of the Marina, but also the entire dredging program in Port Franks. This dredging program includes the spot dredging required in the spring around the marina, and the dredging contract that maintains the river mouth. The cost of this contract is approximately \$58,000 annually, increasing each year based on the agreed contract. In addition to the set contract costs, spot dredging and out of scope maintenance is included in the budget each year. The 2020 budget was set at \$90,000 and actual costs were \$75,000 (due to high water, minimal spot dredging was required). Regardless of the operation of the marina, the municipality will incur these costs if it continues to provide clear channel services for boaters using the Port Franks area.

In 2020 the revenue generated was greatly impacted by the lack of seasonal rentals. The following table summarizes the revenues and expenses for 2020:

Revenue		
Item	2020 Budget	Year to Date
Other Leases	\$18,000	\$22,053
Season Dockage	\$148,000	\$26,871
Launch Ramp	\$28,000	\$50,935
Other Revenue	\$2,372	\$3,659
Trans. from Reserve	\$35,000	\$0
Total	\$231,372	\$103,518
Expenses		
Wages	\$74,833	\$62,223
Utilities	\$15,533	\$3,513
Insurance	\$5,305	\$6,035
Annual Dock Main.	\$37,000	\$2,645
General Maintenance	\$23,620	\$10,647
Dredging	\$90,000	\$75,650
Misc Expenses	\$2,022	\$1,184
Total	\$248,313	\$161,896
Grand Total	-\$16,941	-\$58,378

It should be noted that we expect the final seasonal dockage revenue to be lower than shown due to refunds still being processed, some of which will be transferred to next year at the owner's request. In addition, we would note that the high launch ramp use this year is likely attributed to a few factors. The lack of a public launch at Poplar Ave., other public launches in neighbouring municipalities being closed made the Port Franks launch one of the few available in the area, in addition, COVID-19 opened up opportunities for some people to enjoy more boating activities in 2020, as they were not working or had modified work hours. Whether or not this level of launch ramp use will continue in future years is unknown.

If Council chooses to not operate seasonal docks next year and maintain the operation of the launch and day use, the expectation is that the operating loss will be in the order of \$60,000 - \$80,000.

If Council chooses to close the facility entirely, with no source of revenue, the expectation is that the losses would be in the order of magnitude of \$100,000 depending on maintenance requirements of the facility and dredging program.

If Council chooses to remediate the marina to allow docks to be installed, normal operations of the Marina would continue as in past years, however the estimated capital costs that would be incurred are summarized below:

Installation of wall extension:	\$210,000
Extension of dock pilings:	\$10,000
Installation of steps	<u>\$5,000</u>
Total:	\$225,000

CONSULTATION

Community Service Staff
Port Franks Yacht Club representatives
Kevin Williams - CAO
Janet Ferguson - Treasurer